

**MIGRATION BETWEEN  
MEXICO AND THE  
UNITED STATES**



# MIGRATION BETWEEN MEXICO AND THE UNITED STATES



## BINATIONAL STUDY



### VOLUME 1 THEMATIC CHAPTERS

MEXICO-UNITED STATES BINATIONAL MIGRATION STUDY



Mexican Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
Mexico City

U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform  
Washington, D.C.

Copyright © 1998 by Mexican Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
and U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform

*All rights reserved.*

One-time publication rights. All rights revert to authors of the reports.  
No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval  
system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic,  
mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the  
prior permission of the publisher or the authors of the reports.

Mexican Ministry  
of Foreign Affairs  
Mexico City

U.S. Commission on  
Immigration Reform  
Washington, D.C.

Mexico-United States Binational Migration Study.

Migration between Mexico and the United States.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

Contents: v. 1. Thematic chapters — v. 2-3. Research and Materials.

1. Mexico—Emigration and immigration. 2. United States—Emigration and  
immigration. 3. Mexicans—United States. 4. Mexican-Americans. 5. Immigrants—United  
States. I. Title.

JV7401.M54 1998 325.72 98-65937  
(pbk.: alk. paper)



Printed in the United States of America  
at Morgan Printing in Austin, Texas

# Contents

---

## Volume 1 • Thematic Chapters

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| The Quantification of Migration between Mexico and the United States<br><i>Frank D. Bean, Rodolfo Corona, Rodolfo Tuirán<br/>and Karen A. Woodrow-Lafield</i> ..... | 1   |
| Characteristics of Migrants: Mexicans in the United States<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> ..... | 91  |
| Factors that Influence Migration<br><i>Agustín Escobar Latapí, Philip Martin, Paul S. Davies,<br/>Gustavo López Castro and Katharine Donato</i> .....               | 163 |
| Impacts of Migration:<br>U.S. Impacts of Mexican Immigration<br><i>Michael J. Greenwood and Marta Tienda</i> .....  | 251 |
| Impacts of Migration in Mexico<br><i>Gustavo Verduzco and Kurt Unger</i> .....  | 395 |
| Responses to Migration Issues<br><i>Sidney Weintraub, Francisco Alba, Rafael Fernández de Castro<br/>and Manuel García y Griego</i> .....                           | 437 |

## Volume 2 • Research Reports and Background Materials

### QUANTIFICATION OF MIGRATION

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Estimating Unauthorized Mexican Migration to the<br>United States: Issues and Results<br><i>Jennifer Van Hook and Frank D. Bean</i> .....                                       | 511 |
| Estimating Underenumeration among Unauthorized Mexican<br>Migrants to the United States: Applications of Mortality Analyses<br><i>Jennifer Van Hook and Frank D. Bean</i> ..... | 551 |
| The Mexican-origin Population of the United States in the<br>Twentieth Century<br><i>Jennifer E. Glick and Jennifer Van Hook</i> .....  | 571 |
| Emigration: Implications for U.S. Immigration Policy Research<br><i>Ellen Percy Kraly</i> .....   | 587 |
| Estimating Authorized Immigration<br><i>Karen A. Woodrow-Lafield</i> .....  | 619 |
| Viewing Emigration at Century's End<br><i>Karen A. Woodrow-Lafield</i> .....  | 683 |

### CHARACTERISTICS OF MIGRANTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| The Process of Acquiring Citizenship and/or Nationality<br>at Birth in Mexico and the United States<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> .....                               | 695 |
| The Selectivity of International Labor Migration and<br>Characteristics of Mexico-to-U.S. Migrants:<br>Theoretical Considerations<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> ..... | 699 |
| Data Sources<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> .....  | 709 |
| Immigrant Characteristics from U.S. Data Sources<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> .....  | 747 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Mexico-to-U.S. Migrant Characteristics from Surveys<br>Involving Samples Drawn in Mexico<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> ..... | 769 |
| Mexico-to-U.S. Migrant Characteristics from Mexican<br>Data Sources<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante, Guillermina Jasso, J. Edward Taylor<br/>and Paz Trigueros Legarreta</i> .....                      | 779 |
| Some Thoughts on Perceptions and Policies<br><i>Jorge A. Bustamante</i> .....   | 819 |

### **Volume 3 • Research Reports and Background Materials**

#### **FACTORS THAT INFLUENCE MIGRATION**

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| U.S.-Mexican Migration<br><i>Philip Martin</i> .....                               | 869 |
| Mexican Immigrant Workers and U.S. Food Expenditures<br><i>Philip Martin</i> ..... | 871 |
| Guest Workers: Past and Present<br><i>Philip Martin</i> .....                      | 877 |
| Proposition 187 in California<br><i>Philip Martin</i> .....                        | 897 |
| Mexican Migration Project Data<br><i>Katharine Donato</i> .....                    | 903 |
| Coyotes and Alien Smuggling<br><i>Gustavo López Castro</i> .....                   | 965 |
| Factores de la Migración y Redes Migratorias<br><i>Jean Papail</i> .....           | 975 |

#### **IMPACTS OF MIGRATION**

|   |      |
|---|------|
| The Participation of Mexican-born Households in<br>Means-tested U.S. Welfare Programs<br><i>Paul S. Davies and Michael J. Greenwood</i> ..... | 1001 |
|---|------|

|   |      |
|---|------|
| Labor Market Implications of Mexican Migration:<br>Economies of Scale, Innovation, and Entrepreneurship<br><i>Michael J. Rosenfeld and Marta Tienda</i> . . . . .             | 1049 |
| The U.S. Labor Market Impacts of Low-skill Migration<br>from Mexico<br><i>Paul S. Davies, Michael J. Greenwood, Gary L. Hunt,<br/>Ulrich Kohli and Marta Tienda</i> . . . . . | 1075 |
| Mexican Immigrants and Mexican American Political<br>Assimilation<br><i>Michael J. Rosenfeld</i> . . . . .  | 1117 |
| Transferability of Skills and the Economic Rewards to U.S.<br>Employment for Return Migrants in Mexico<br><i>Steven S. Zahniser and Michael J. Greenwood</i> . . . . .        | 1133 |
| Impactos de las Cambios Económicos en el Agro Mexicano<br>y en la Migración: Un Análisis Micro-multisectorial<br><i>Antonio Yúnez Naude</i> . . . . .                         | 1153 |
| Las Remesas de los Migrantes Mexicanos en Estados Unidos:<br>Estimaciones para 1995<br><i>Fernando Lozano Ascencio</i> . . . . .  | 1189 |

## **RESPONSES TO MIGRATION**

|  |      |
|--|------|
| The Bracero Program<br><i>Manuel García y Griego</i> . . . . .                                   | 1215 |
| Mexico's 1982 Economic Crisis<br><i>Francisco Alba</i> . . . . .                                 | 1223 |
| IRCA and the Facilitation of U.S.-Mexico Migration Dialogue<br><i>Sidney Weintraub</i> . . . . . | 1229 |
| The Riverside Incident<br><i>Rafael Fernández de Castro</i> . . . . .                            | 1235 |
| Selected Court Cases on Immigration Enforcement<br><i>U.S. Court Decisions</i> . . . . .         | 1241 |
| On the Unrenounceability of Mexican Nationality<br><i>Sidney Weintraub</i> . . . . .             | 1249 |

# Acknowledgements

---

**T**he Mexico/United States Binational Study on Migration was a joint effort undertaken by twenty scholars from both countries who worked together in teams on five separate subject areas. The subject areas and team members are listed below. These researchers wrote background research papers and individual team reports, whose information and conclusions were collaboratively condensed and compiled into a joint summary report published under the title *The Binational Study on Migration Between Mexico and the United States*. The present three-volume publication contains the individual team reports (Volume 1) and background research papers and materials (Volumes 2 and 3) that were prepared as part of the Binational Study and that constitute the basis for the joint summary. We are appreciative of the efforts of the team members who, despite their different academic disciplines and subject area expertise, worked in a productive and collegial atmosphere. The summary report, the team reports, and the background papers all demonstrate the commitment of the binational members to producing a state-of-the art assessment of many aspects of Mexico-to-United States migration.

The Binational Study was funded by both the Mexican and United States governments in conjunction with private sector funding in both countries. This

structure was created to optimize the independence of the research teams and to make the final summary report immediately available to institutions interested in the critical role of migration in the bilateral relationship. The Mexican Ministry of Foreign Affairs funded the Study and, with the Ministry of Interior, supported the work of this Study. The U.S. Congress appropriated funds coordinated by the U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform, and both the U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service and the Department of State made contributions. We also acknowledge funding received from the Consejo Nacional de Ciencia y Tecnología and the United States Information Service in Mexico. Private sector funders were very interested in the project. The Fundación Muguel Alemán in Mexico contributed and the Ford and the Hewlett Foundations in the United States also supported the entire project.

We are grateful for the data and information supplied to the Binational Study by government institutions in Mexico and the United States. We also appreciate the commissioned analyses prepared by Mexican and American consultants to the Study.

Finally, we acknowledge the many individuals in both countries who gave of their time and assisted the Study in gaining invaluable insights above and beyond the more mundane aspects of academic research. The Binational Study alternated its meeting sites between Mexico and the United States and visited several communities in both countries. Government officials were forthcoming in sharing information and hosting opportunities to learn in Mexico City, San Diego, Tijuana, Oaxaca, Washington, San Antonio, and Chicago. The members of the Binational Study especially appreciated the frank exchanges with community residents and migrants in Tijuana, Oaxaca, Guadalajara, and Chicago.

The publication of the present three-volume set did not occur before the U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform sunset on December 31, 1997. Publication was thus subsequently undertaken by the Mexican Migration and Policy Program of The University of Texas at Austin, a joint program of the Lyndon B. Johnson School of Public Affairs and the Population Research Center, under the supervision of Frank D. Bean. The three volumes and the joint summary are also currently available electronically from <http://www.utexas.edu/lbj/uscir>. Special thanks are owed to Anne Isenhower, without whose Herculean and well-organized efforts this project would not have been completed. José A. Arréllaga Acosta, Maria McGivney Arréllaga, Marlena Crusere, Eve Kleinman, Raquel Marquez, Nancy Meredith, Terry Sherrell, and Ruth Whintont also provided valuable assistance. Other members of the staff of both the LBJ School and the Population Research Center also helped in the publication of these volumes, for which the Binational Study wishes to express its gratitude.

## **NATIONAL COORDINATORS AND STAFF**

United States Coordinators:

Susan Martin, United States National Coordinator, Executive Director,  
U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform (USCIR)

B. Lindsay Lowell, Assistant United States National Coordinator (USCIR)

Deborah Meyers, Project Associate (USCIR)

Mexican Coordinators:

Enrique Loaeza Tovar, Coordinador Nacional de México, Secretaría de  
Relaciones Exteriores

Carlos Planck, Coordinador Adjunto, Secretaría de Gobernación

Remedios Gómez Arnau, Secretaria Técnica del Estudio Universidad  
Nacional Autónoma de México

### **1. QUANTIFICATION OF MIGRATION**

Frank D. Bean, University of Texas at Austin\*

Rodolfo Corona, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte\*

Rodolfo Tuirán, Consejo Nacional de Población

Karen A. Woodrow-Lafield, Mississippi State University

### **2. CHARACTERISTICS OF MIGRANTS**

Jorge Bustamante, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte\*

Guillermina Jasso, New York University\*

Edward J. Taylor, University of California at Davis

Paz Trigueros, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana

### **3. FACTORS THAT INFLUENCE MIGRATION**

Agustín Escobar Latapí, Centro de Investigaciones y Estudios Superiores  
en Antropología Social\*

Philip Martin, University of California at Davis\*

Katharine Donato, Louisiana State University

Gustavo López Castro, El Colegio de Michoacán

### **4. EFFECTS OF MIGRATION**

Marta Tienda, Princeton University\*

Gustavo Verduzco, El Colegio de México\*

Michael J. Greenwood, University of Colorado

Kurt Unger, Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas

## **5. RESPONSES TO MIGRATION**

Francisco Alba, El Colegio de México\*

Sidney Weintraub, Center for Strategic and International Studies,  
Washington, D.C.\*

Rafael Fernández de Castro, Instituto Tecnológico Autónomo de México

Manuel García y Griego, University of California at Irvine

\*Core Group Member/Lead

# Contributors

---

*Alba, Francisco*, El Colegio de México

*Bean, Frank D.*, The University of Texas at Austin

*Bustamante, Jorge A.*, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte

*Corona, Rodolfo*, El Colegio de la Frontera Norte

*Davies, Paul S.*, Social Security Administration\*

*Donato, Katharine*, Louisiana State University

*Escobar Latapí, Agustín*, Centro de Investigaciones y  
Estudios Superiores en Antropología Social

*Fernández de Castro, Rafael*, Instituto Tecnológico Autónomo de México

*García y Griego, Manuel*, University of California, Irvine

*Glick, Jennifer E.*, The University of Texas at Austin

*Greenwood, Michael J.*, University of Colorado at Boulder

*Hunt, Gary L.*, University of Maine, Orono

*Jasso, Guillermina*, New York University

- Kohli, Ulrich**, University of Geneva
- Kraly, Ellen Percy**, Colgate University
- López Castro, Gustavo**, El Colegio de Michoacán
- Lozano Ascencio, Fernando**, The University of Texas at Austin
- Martin, Philip**, University of California, Davis
- Papaíl, Jean**, Universidad de Guadalajara
- Parrado, Emilio A.**, University of Pennsylvania
- Rosenfeld, Michael J.**, University of Chicago
- Taylor, J. Edward**, University of California, Davis
- Tienda, Marta**, Princeton University
- Trigueros Legarreta, Paz**, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana
- Tuirán, Rodolfo**, Consejo Nacional de Población
- Unger, Kurt**, Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas
- Van Hook, Jennifer**, The University of Texas at Austin
- Verduzco, Gustavo**, El Colegio de México
- Weintraub, Sidney**, Center for Strategic and International Studies,  
Washington, D.C.
- Woodrow-Lafield, Karen A.**, Mississippi State University
- Yúnez Naude, Antonio**, University of California, Davis
- Zahniser, Steven S.**, University of Colorado at Boulder

---

\* This research was conducted while Paul Davies was at the University of Colorado at Boulder. The views expressed are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the Social Security Administration.